

Is user-centered design in conflict with cataloging ethics?

Hanna Bertoldi, Mikala Narlock, Griesinger Peggy

Publication Date

09-12-2023

License

This work is made available under a CC BY 4.0 license and should only be used in accordance with that license.

Citation for this work (American Psychological Association 7th edition)

Bertoldi, H., Narlock, M., & Peggy, G. (2021). *Is user-centered design in conflict with cataloging ethics?* (Version 1). University of Notre Dame. <https://doi.org/10.7274/r0-5q79-rr41>

This work was downloaded from CurateND, the University of Notre Dame's institutional repository.

For more information about this work, to report or an issue, or to preserve and share your original work, please contact the CurateND team for assistance at curate@nd.edu.

Is user-centered design in conflict with cataloging ethics?

Greetings! This is a shared, public document that corresponds with the LD4 2021 Birds-of-a-feather session. This is a safe space that abides by the Chatham House Rules and follows the LD4 Code of Conduct.

This document will remain active at this link: <https://bit.ly/LD4-users-ethics>

NOTE: If you would like to comment anonymously, please ensure you have signed out of any Google Account and/or open this in a private or incognito window.

Possible Discussion Questions	1
Breakout room	1
Exit discussion	2
Collaborative note taking	2
Breakout room 1 (Hanna)	2
Breakout room 2 (Mikala)	4
Breakout room 3 (Peggy)	5
Exit discussion	5
Additional comments/questions	6
Critical readings and helpful resources	7

Possible Discussion Questions

Breakout room

- How have you navigated requests for information about contemporary creators at your institution? Does it matter who is making the request in how you respond?
- What are some positive projects that have supported creator privacy, such as asking creators for consent? What work needs to be done around linked open data and creator identities?
- Should online collections strive to expose works by underrepresented identity groups? Why or why not?
- Should our online collections communicate the ambiguity, bias, nuance, and changeability we know is present in our cataloging to our users? And if so, how? Similarly, keynote speaker Lauren Klein spoke about how data is presented can make it look more or less reliable. Can this concept be applied to the design choices we use for online collections?
- Dr. Melodie Fox (2016) argues that how knowledge is organized can cause marginalization of human groups (e.g. through mutual exclusivity, linearity, and hierarchy). By cataloging specific aspects of creators' identities, are we objectifying them? Is this a form of oppression? Or are we creating better access for our users?

- The concept of catalogers' judgement, defined by Jennifer M. Martin (2021) as "the considered application of professional experience to cataloging decisions," is an integral part of resource description work, but also an area where implicit bias can really do some damage. How can we reconcile these two facts?
- Keynote speaker Jessica Meyerson asked, "Why is data enhancement an inherent good?" Is data enhancement an inherent good? Why or why not?

Exit discussion

- What was something that surprised you during the breakout room discussion?
- Should users be able to search on creator identity terms? Does a feature like this assist in data transparency or violate creator privacy? Repeating one of the ideas raised in the Smithsonian's presentation on modeling data, what are the risks in displaying or not displaying properties that may violate a creator's privacy?
- What would make you more or less likely to challenge practices?
- Can online catalogs be both sensitive to user needs and also creator privacy? Or do we need to radically change how our users expect to interact with online collections?

Critical readings and helpful resources

Anderson, S., 2020. "Some Provocations on the Digital Future of Museums," In: K. Winesmith and S. Anderson (eds.), *The Digital Future of Museums: Conversations and Provocations*. Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 10-25.

Bahnemann, G., M. Carroll, P. Clough, M. Einaudi, C. Ewing, J. Mixter, J. Roy, H. Tomren, B. Washburn, and E. Williams, 2021. "Transforming Metadata into Linked Data to Improve Digital Collection Discoverability: A CONTENTdm Pilot Project," OCLC.

<https://www.oclc.org/content/dam/research/publications/2021/oclcresearch-transforming-metadata-into-linked-data.pdf>

Billey, A., 2019. "Just Because We Can, Doesn't Mean We Should: An Argument for Simplicity and Data Privacy With Name Authority Work in the Linked Data Environment," *Journal of Library Metadata*, 19:1-2, 1-17.

Brown, N. M., R. Mendenhall, M. Black, M. Van Moer, K. Flynn, M. McKee, A. Zerai, I. Lourentzou, and C.X. Zhai, 2019. "In Search of Zora/When Metadata Isn't Enough: Rescuing the Experiences of Black Women Through Statistical Modeling," *Journal of Library Metadata*, 19:3-4, 141-162.

D'Ignazio, Catherine, and Klein, Lauren F. 2020. *Data Feminism*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press (particularly chapters 4 and 5).

- Dilger, B., and W. Thompson, 2008. "Ubiquitous Cataloging," In: K. R. Roberto and S. Berman (eds.), *Radical Cataloging: Essays at the Front*. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 40-52.
- Drabinski, E., 2008. "Teaching the Radical Catalog," In: K. R. Roberto and S. Berman (eds.), *Radical Cataloging: Essays at the Front*. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 198-205.
- Fox, M. J., 2016. "Priorities of Arrangement" or a "Hierarchy of Oppressions?" *Knowledge Organization* 43:5, 373-83.
- Gross, T., and V. B. Fox, 2018. "Authority Work as Outreach," In: J. Sandberg (ed.), *Ethical Questions in Name Authority Control*. Sacramento, CA: Library Juice Press, 337-350.
- Jeannet, P., 2021. "The Ethics of Describing Images: Representing Racial Identities in Photographic Collections," *Catalogue and Index*, 202, 30-43.
https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.cilip.org.uk/resource/collection/CC45A47F-BE48-4BA1-B6D4-25BF10F1BC41/C&I202Jeannet_describing_images.pdf
- Karp, I., C. M. Kreamer, and S. D. Lavine, 1992. *Museums and Communities: The Politics of Public Culture*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press (particularly part 1).
- Krmpotich, C., and A. Somerville. 2016. "Affective Presence: The Metonymical Catalogue," *Museum Anthropology* 39:2, 178-91.
- "List of Alternative Vocabularies," *Cataloging Lab*. <https://cataloginglab.org/list-of-alternative-vocabularies/>
- Martin, J. M., 2021. "Records, Responsibility, and Power: An Overview of Cataloging Ethics," *Cataloging & Classification Quarterly*, 59:2-3, 281-304.
- Okun, T., 1999. "White Supremacy Culture," *Dismantling Racism*.
https://www.dismantlingracism.org/uploads/4/3/5/7/43579015/okun_-_white_sup_culture.pdf
- "Problem LCSH," *Cataloging Lab*. <https://cataloginglab.org/problem-lcsh/>
- Rose, M. Z., 2012. "The Ship Has Sailed and We Aren't On It: How Catalogers Could Support User Tasks and Why We Won't," *Journal of Library Metadata*, 12:2-3, 127-139.
- Shellman, C., 2019. "A Totally Inclusive Museum," *American Alliance of Museums*.
<https://www.aam-us.org/2019/02/20/a-totally-inclusive-museum/>
- Thompson, Kelly J. J. 2016. "More Than a Name: A Content Analysis of Name Authority Records for Authors Who Self-Identify as Trans." *Library Resources and Technical Services* 60:3, 140-55.
- Tillman, R. K., 2018. "Barriers to Ethical Name Modeling in Current Linked Data Encoding Practices," In: J. Sandberg (ed.), *Ethical Questions in Name Authority Control*. Sacramento, CA: Library Juice Press, 243-259.
- Tripodi, F., 2021. "Ms. Categorized: Gender, Notability, and Inequality on Wikipedia," *New Media & Society* June, 1-21.

Turner, H. 2016. "The Computerization of Material Culture Catalogues: Objects and Infrastructure in the Smithsonian Institution's Department of Anthropology," *Museum Anthropology* 39:2, 163-77.

Turner, H., 2020. *Cataloguing Culture: Legacies of Colonialism in Museum Documentation*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Weidner, A., A. M. Washington, and X. Liu, 2019. "Planting Cedar: An Open Source Linked Data Vocabulary Manager at the University of Houston Libraries," *Journal of Library Metadata*, 19:1-2, 53-68

Wiederhold, R. A., and G. F. Reeve, 2021. "Authority Control Today: Principles, Practices, and Trends," *Cataloging & Classification Quarterly*, 59:2-3, 129-158.

"Wikidata:Living people," Wikidata. https://www.wikidata.org/wiki/Wikidata:Living_people

"Wikidata:WikiProject LGBT/gender," Wikidata.
https://www.wikidata.org/wiki/Wikidata:WikiProject_LGBT/gender

"Wikidata:WikiProject Properties/Wikidata properties that may violate privacy," Wikidata.
https://www.wikidata.org/wiki/Wikidata:WikiProject_Properties/Wikidata_properties_that_may_violate_privacy

Wolfe, J., 2008. "Playing Fast and Loose with the Rules: Metadata Cataloging for Digital Library Projects," In: K. R. Roberto and S. Berman (eds.), *Radical Cataloging: Essays at the Front*. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 69-74.

Zhu, L., 2019. "The Future of Authority Control: Issues and Trends in the Linked Data Environment," *Journal of Library Metadata*, 19:3-4, 215-238.